Dedication

To our many students and colleagues, who have taught us so much.
Table of Contents

Preface ix
Prologue xi

Part I Foundations 1

Chapter 1 Introduction: A Framework for Public Health Ethics 3
  by James F. Childress and Ruth Gaare Bernheim
  Introduction: Public Health Ethics: A Preliminary Analysis 3
    What Is Public Health Ethics? 4
    Public Philosophy 5
  Moral Norms 5
    Moral Considerations in Public Health 5
    Relations Between Moral Norms and Public Health 5
  Addressing Ethical Conflicts and Dilemmas in Public Health 6
    Absolutist and Contextualist Approaches 6
    A Presumptivist Approach 7
    Interlude: Summary 7
  Justificatory Conditions for Overriding Norms in Conflict Situations 7
  Public Justification in Context 9
  Ethical Conflicts: Pervasive or Occasional? 10
    Ethical Dimensions of Public Health Decisions 10
    Competing Claims about Ethical Trade-offs in Public Health 11
    Scope of Societal Values: Inclusion of Personal Values 11
    Historical Perspective on Conflicts in Public Health 11
# Table of Contents

Analyzing Ethical Issues in Particular Situations .................................................. 12  
The Role of the Public Health Code of Ethics ...................................................... 13  
Metaphors in Public Health Ethics ...................................................................... 14  
  Public Health as Warfare ................................................................................. 14  
  Public Health as Stewardship ......................................................................... 16  
Conclusions ......................................................................................................... 17  
Discussion Questions ......................................................................................... 18  
References ........................................................................................................... 19

Chapter 2  
Moral Considerations: Bases and Limits for Public Health Interventions ........... 21  
  *by James F. Childress*  
Introduction ........................................................................................................ 21  
Utility: Balancing Probable Benefits, Costs, and Risks ......................................... 22  
  Utility .............................................................................................................. 22  
  Cost-Effectiveness and Cost-Benefit Analyses .................................................. 23  
  Risk Assessment ............................................................................................. 25  
  Variations in Risk Perception ......................................................................... 25  
Distributive Justice ............................................................................................ 25  
  Formal Justice and Material Justice ................................................................. 26  
  Theories of Distributive Justice ..................................................................... 26  
Excursus: Just Care in a Public Health Crisis: Utility and Egalitarian Justice ........ 28  
  Triage in a Public Health Crisis ..................................................................... 28  
  Types of Utility-based Triage .......................................................................... 28  
  Applications of Medical and Social Utility ...................................................... 29  
  Public Participation, Public Trust, and Social Stability ..................................... 30  
Fair Procedures and Processes ........................................................................... 31  
Respect for Autonomous Choices and Liberties ................................................... 32  
  The Intervention Ladder .............................................................................. 32  
  Paternalistic Interventions ............................................................................ 37  
Privacy and Confidentiality ............................................................................... 38  
  Privacy .......................................................................................................... 38  
  Confidentiality .............................................................................................. 39  
Conclusions ........................................................................................................ 41  
Discussion Questions ......................................................................................... 42  
References .......................................................................................................... 43

Chapter 3  
The Political and Legal Context of Public Health Ethics ................................... 45  
  *by Ruth Gaare Bernheim and Richard J. Bonnie*  
Introduction ......................................................................................................... 45  
The Relationship Between Law and Ethics in Public Health .............................. 46
Source and Distribution of Government Authority in Public Health 49
  Case Study: Bathhouse Scenario 51
Constraints on Government Authority: Balancing Individual and Public Interests 53
Does Government Have a Duty to Protect Health? 59
Law as a Tool for Improving Public Health 60
Public Deliberation and Leadership 63
  Case Study: Smoke-Free Policies in Outdoor Public Spaces 68
Conclusions 69
Discussion Questions 70
References 71

Chapter 4 Public Health Perspectives 73
  by Ruth Gaare Bernheim
Introduction 73
Improving Population Health 74
  Evidence-Based and Value-Based Approaches 75
Setting Goals in State and Local Public Health 77
  Case Study: Addressing Heart Disease 77
Proposals for Advisory Committee Review 80
Population Prevention 81
  Implications of Population-Wide Approaches 82
  Determinants and Pathways 83
  Ecological Approaches and Health Inequalities 84
Evidence in Public Health Practice 86
Healthy Communities: Collaborations, Stakeholders, and Systems 88
Conclusions 90
Discussion Questions 92
References 93

Part II Tools and Interventions in Public Health 95

Chapter 5 Surveillance and Public Health Data: The Foundation and Eyes of Public Health 97
  by James F. Childress
Introduction 97
Public Health Surveillance: Its Nature and Goals 98
  What Is Public Health Surveillance? 98
  Types of Public Health Surveillance 98
Who Is Involved in Public Health Surveillance? 99
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter 6</th>
<th>Case Finding: Screening, Testing, and Contact Tracing</th>
<th>119</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>by Alan L. Melnick</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td></td>
<td>119</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Newborn Screening</td>
<td></td>
<td>120</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Case Contact Tracing and Contact (Partner) Notification</td>
<td>122</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Summary: Newborn Screening and Contact Tracing/Notification</td>
<td>123</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Screening and Coerced Treatment of a Pregnant Woman for HIV Infection</td>
<td>123</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Overview of Prenatal HIV Screening and Treatment</td>
<td>123</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Case Description</td>
<td></td>
<td>128</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ethics Framework</td>
<td></td>
<td>128</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HIV/Syphilis Contact Investigation and Partner Notification</td>
<td>134</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Overview of Contact Investigation and Partner Notification</td>
<td>134</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Case Description</td>
<td></td>
<td>135</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ethics Framework</td>
<td></td>
<td>135</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conclusions</td>
<td></td>
<td>139</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Discussion Questions</td>
<td></td>
<td>141</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>References</td>
<td></td>
<td>142</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter 7</th>
<th>Immunization: Protection Through Vaccination</th>
<th>145</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>by James F. Childress</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td></td>
<td>145</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mass Immunization Programs: Justifications</td>
<td>146</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jacobson v. Massachusetts</td>
<td></td>
<td>146</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Topic</td>
<td>Page</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Societal Self-Defense for the Common Good</td>
<td>146</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Balancing Principles</td>
<td>147</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>More Specific Guidance for Mass Immunization Programs</td>
<td>148</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Voluntary and Mandatory Immunization Programs</td>
<td>148</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Persuasion and/or Coercion?</td>
<td>148</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Incentive Rewards or Monetary Sanctions?</td>
<td>149</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Targeted Vaccinations</td>
<td>151</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Case Study: Annual Influenza Vaccination for Nursing Home Staff:</td>
<td>151</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mandatory or Voluntary?</td>
<td>151</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Exemptions from Mandatory Vaccination Programs</td>
<td>152</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Variations in State Exemptions</td>
<td>152</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Exemption of Conscientious Objectors</td>
<td>154</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Case Study: Should Religiously Based and Philosophical/Personal</td>
<td>154</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Objections to Vaccinations Be Recognized as Bases for Exemption?</td>
<td>154</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Religious Convictions</td>
<td>154</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Philosophical and Personal Beliefs</td>
<td>155</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Free Choices or Hurdles and Nudges?</td>
<td>155</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Case Study: Debating Whether the HPV Vaccination Should Be Mandatory</td>
<td>156</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Background</td>
<td>156</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pro and Con Arguments About the HPV Vaccine</td>
<td>156</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>For Females Only?</td>
<td>158</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cost</td>
<td>158</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Symbolic Significance of Legal Mandates</td>
<td>159</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Exemption from HPV Mandates</td>
<td>159</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Justice, Fairness, and Compensation for Vaccine-Related Injuries</td>
<td>159</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Allocating Scarce Vaccines: Utility and Fairness</td>
<td>160</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Case Study: Allocating Influenza Vaccine in a Serious Shortage:</td>
<td>160</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The 2004–2005 “Crisis”</td>
<td>160</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Background</td>
<td>160</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public Health Decisions About Vaccine Allocation</td>
<td>161</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other Criteria and Methods of Rationing Vaccine</td>
<td>163</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lessons Learned, Questions Raised for a Possible Influenza Pandemic</td>
<td>164</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conclusions</td>
<td>166</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Discussion Questions</td>
<td>167</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>References</td>
<td>168</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Chapter 8: Containing Communicable Diseases: Personal Control Measures

by Alan L. Melnick

Introduction                                                   171

Directly Observed Therapy for Multiple Drug-Resistant Tuberculosis

Background                                                  172
## Case 1: Ordering Directly Observed Therapy for MDR TB
- **Background**: 173
- **Ethical Analysis and Assessment of this Case**: 174

## Personal and Community Control Measures in Response to Outbreak of Severe Respiratory Illness
- **Background**: 179
- **Monitoring: Active and Passive**: 180
- **Types of Quarantine**: 180
- **Focused and Community-Wide Measures to Create Social Distance: Benefit-Risk Analysis**: 181

## Case 2: Controlling Severe Respiratory Illness of Unknown Etiology at a Major University
- **Background**: 182
- **Ethical Framework**: 183
- **Conclusions**: 188
- **Discussion Questions**: 189
- **References**: 189

## Chapter 9 Health Communication
*by Ruth Gaare Bernheim and Richard J. Bonnie*

### Introduction
193

### Government’s Role in Using and Regulating Mass Communication
- **Early Government Health Education Efforts**: 194
- **Possible Aims and Justifications**: 195

### Overview of First Amendment Constraints
- **Principles and Concepts**: 196
- **Commercial Advertising**: 197
- **Mandated Factual Disclosures**: 198
- **Government Speech**: 198

### Aggressive Tobacco Control: New Frontiers of the First Amendment
- **Restrictions on Tobacco Advertising**: 199
- **Aggressive Package Regulation**: 200
- **Government-Supported Media Campaigns**: 202

### Ethical Dimensions of Government Communication
- **Providing Information**: 207
- **Persuading With and Without Explicit Reasons**: 208
- **Marketing Health**: 210
- **Empowering Health**: 210

### Conclusions
214

### Discussion Questions
215

### References
216
# Chapter 10

**Public Health and the Environment**

*by Alan L. Melnick*

## Introduction

219

## Part 1: Ethical Perspectives on Environmental Policies:

- Water Fluoridation and Lead
- Water Fluoridation: Too Much or Too Little?
- Fluoridation History and Trends
- Benefits of Fluoridation
- Opposition to Fluoridation
- Continuing Deliberation
- Lead: Too Much for Some

224

## Part 2: Environmental Public Health Practice

- Introduction
- Case Study: Lead Poisoning at a Private Indoor Shooting Range
- Ethical Framework
- Case Study: Banning Raw Milk Sales at Local Farmers’ Markets
- Ethical Framework
- Conclusions
- Discussion Questions
- References

247

## Index

249
This book grows out of our interactions in teaching, research and writing, and collaborative projects. Even though this is the first project in which all four of us have collaborated at the same time, we have had many opportunities to work together in various combinations. Those collaborations enabled us to develop the frameworks for this book. This is an integrated book, which grows out of these shared experiences, but we decided it would be useful to list the primary author or authors for each chapter.

We have dedicated this book to our many students and colleagues from whom we have learned so much. Our interactions with students in the classroom as well as those with colleagues in co-teaching, collaborative projects, and conferences have stimulated our reflections and helped us refine our ideas. They have also given us confidence that the frameworks we use in this book can be helpful.

We thank several doctoral students in ethics in the Department of Religious Studies at the University of Virginia for their valuable assistance in the preparation of this book. Laura Alexander, Matthew Puffer, and Mark Storslee provided research assistance on bibliography and arguments for several chapters, and Betsy Mesard, Travis Pickell, and Matthew Puffer prepared the teaching ancillaries. We are also grateful to Aaron Pannone for his help in developing several figures for the book. James Childress wishes to thank his colleagues at the Centre for the Advanced Study of Bioethics at the University of Münster for helpful conversations on John Stuart Mill, public health ethics, and paternalism, in May and June of 2011. Ruth Gaare Bernheim wishes to express her appreciation to Drue Barrett and Leonard Ortmann in the Public Health Ethics Unit at the Centers for Disease Control and Prevention.

Ruth Gaare Bernheim, James F. Childress, Richard J. Bonnie, and Alan L. Melnick
As series editor of the Essential Public Health series, I am delighted that Essentials of Public Health Ethics is now part of our offerings. Essentials of Public Health Ethics represents a world-class effort to teach ethics and integrate it into the continuum of public health education. The book reflects the combined efforts of four exceptional authors with decades of experience teaching ethics to a wide range of students in a variety of formats. The authors are all distinguished practitioners, teachers, and scholars in public health ethics and law.

The book begins with a clear, compelling framework for thinking about public health ethics. This framework is integrated throughout the book. Subsequent chapters are devoted to areas of application presented in a logical order, enabling the text to develop an integrated approach. The variety of applications provides flexibility in utilizing the text in course work.

The cases and approach are classroom- and practitioner-tested, having been successfully used to teach students from across the country as well as discussed by practitioners at local and national meetings. Students will find the cases relevant and the analysis insightful. The authors’ extraordinary talents and experience allow them to walk students through complex ethical decision making, providing students with progressive ability to tackle new ethical issues on their own.

Take a look at the table of contents and the introductory material, followed by a scan of the chapters. You will find a welcoming yet challenging approach to public health ethics that should appeal to students from a wide range of disciplines headed for diverse careers. Public health ethics has become a key component of public health education. Now there is a text that makes public health ethics come alive.

Richard Riegelman, MD, PhD
Editor, Essential Public Health series