

Comparative Public Budgeting

A Global Perspective

Edited by

Charles E. Menifield, PhD

Associate Professor
University of Memphis
Memphis, Tennessee

Visiting Associate Professor
University of Nebraska—Omaha
Omaha, Nebraska



JONES & BARTLETT
LEARNING

World Headquarters

Jones & Bartlett Learning
40 Tall Pine Drive
Sudbury, MA 01776
978-443-5000
info@jblearning.com
www.jblearning.com

Jones & Bartlett Learning
Canada
6339 Ormindale Way
Mississauga, Ontario L5V 1J2
Canada

Jones & Bartlett Learning
International
Barb House, Barb Mews
London W6 7PA
United Kingdom

Jones & Bartlett Learning books and products are available through most bookstores and online booksellers. To contact Jones & Bartlett Learning directly, call 800-832-0034, fax 978-443-8000, or visit our website, www.jblearning.com.

Substantial discounts on bulk quantities of Jones & Bartlett Learning publications are available to corporations, professional associations, and other qualified organizations. For details and specific discount information, contact the special sales department at Jones & Bartlett Learning via the above contact information or send an email to specialsales@jblearning.com.

Copyright © 2011 by Jones & Bartlett Learning, LLC

All rights reserved. No part of the material protected by this copyright may be reproduced or utilized in any form, electronic or mechanical, including photocopying, recording, or by any information storage and retrieval system, without written permission from the copyright owner.

This publication is designed to provide accurate and authoritative information in regard to the Subject Matter covered. It is sold with the understanding that the publisher is not engaged in rendering legal, accounting, or other professional service. If legal advice or other expert assistance is required, the service of a competent professional person should be sought.

Production Credits

Publisher: Michael Brown
Associate Editor: Catie Heverling
Editorial Assistant: Teresa Reilly
Production Manager: Tracey Chapman
Associate Production Editor: Kate Stein
Senior Marketing Manager: Sophie Fleck
Manufacturing and Inventory Control Supervisor: Amy Bacus
Composition: DSCS, LLC/Absolute Service, Inc.
Photo Research and Permissions Manager: Kimberly Potvin
Cover Design: Kristin E. Parker
Cover Image: © SVLumagraphica/Shutterstock, Inc.
Printing and Binding: Malloy, Inc.
Cover Printing: Malloy, Inc.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Menifield, Charles.
Comparative public budgeting : a global perspective / Charles E. Menifield.
p. cm.
Includes bibliographical references and index.
ISBN-13: 978-0-7637-8010-4 (pbk.)
ISBN-10: 0-7637-8010-3 (ibid.)
1. Budget process. 2. Budget. I. Title.
HJ2009.M46 2011
352.4'8—dc22

2010010516

6048

Printed in the United States of America

14 13 12 11 10 10 9 8 7 6 5 4 3 2 1



Contents

About the Editor vii
Contributors ix
Reviewers xv

Chapter 1 An Introduction to Comparative Budgeting 1
Charles E. Menifield

Part 1 Africa

Chapter 2 The Republic of Ghana: A Success Story? 21
Craig S. Maher

Part 2 Asia

- Chapter 3** Accountability Building Through Budgetary Reform: China's Experience 43
Meili Niu
- Chapter 4** Budgetary and Financial Management Reforms in Korea 59
Changhoon Jung and Cal Clark
- Chapter 5** Budgeting for Results: Enhancing the Budget Process in the Philippines
Through Reforms 77
Hazel Marie A. Sarmiento
- Chapter 6** The Limits of Budget Reform in Taiwan 91
Tsuey-ping Lee and Cal Clark
- Chapter 7** Public Budgeting and Financial Management Performance in Thailand 107
Arwiphawee Srithongrun
- Chapter 8** Budgeting in Vietnam: Decentralized Decision Making in a
Unitary Budget Environment 133
Phuong Nguyen-Hoang and Larry Schroeder

Part 3 Europe

- Chapter 9** Italian Central Government Budgeting: Future Hopes and
Past Disappointments 151
Riccardo Mussari, Pasquale Ruggiero, and Patrizio Monfardini
- Chapter 10** Public Sector Budgeting in the United Kingdom: Devolution of
Powers and Responsibilities 177
Stephen J. Bailey and William McCabe

Part 4 The Middle East

- Chapter 11** Budgeting Under Resource Abundance and Hesitant Steps to
Decentralized Investment Planning and Budgeting in Iraq 203
Ronald W. Johnson and Ricardo Silva-Morales
- Chapter 12** Budget Discipline and Undisciplined Politics: The Case of Jordan 221
Jamil E. Jreisat
- Chapter 13** Budget Making and Intergovernmental Fiscal Relations in Pakistan 237
Roy Bahl, Musharraf R. Cyan, and Sally Wallace

Chapter 14	Budgetary Systems in Saudi Arabia: Reform Needed	257
	Bassam ALBassam	
Chapter 15	Finance Reform and Performance-Based Budgeting in the United Arab Emirates	275
	Deniz Zeynep Leuenberger	
 Part 5 North America		
Chapter 16	Review and Reallocation in the Canadian Federal Government's Budgetary System	289
	Mike Joyce	
Chapter 17	Decentralization, Budgets, and the Challenge of Intergovernmental Coordination: Lessons from Mexico	311
	Salvador Espinosa P.	
Chapter 18	Federal Budgeting in the United States	329
	Marvin Phaup and Charlotte Kirschner	
 Part 6 South America		
Chapter 19	Budgeting in Brazil Under the Law of Fiscal Responsibility	353
	Christine R. Martell	
 Part 7 Conclusion		
Chapter 20	Learning from Others: Comparative Budgeting in the New Millennia	371
	Charles E. Menifield and LaShonda M. Stewart	
	Index	387

A row of flags on poles in front of a skyscraper. The flags are flying in the wind. The skyscraper is a tall, modern building with a grid-like facade. The text "About the Editor" is overlaid on the right side of the image.

About the Editor

Charles E. Menifield is an associate professor in the Division of Public and Nonprofit Administration at the University of Memphis where he teaches courses in budgeting and financial management, public management information systems, research methods, and public policy statistics. His main research areas are public budgeting and finance and Southern politics. He has authored or edited four books and has written numerous articles for public administration and political science journals. He currently serves on the Executive Council for the Association for Budgeting and Financial Management and the National Association for Schools of Public Affairs and Administration.



Contributors

Bassam ALBassam is an instructor of public administration/public finance and faculty member at the Institute of Public Administration (IPA) in Saudi Arabia. He specializes in public finance, budgeting, and strategic planning, and has participated in many consulting projects for public and private sectors. He is a PhD candidate in public administration at Florida Atlantic University with a concentration in financial management.

Roy Bahl is Regents Professor of Economics and Founding Dean of Andrew Young School of Policy Studies at Georgia State University. Dr. Bahl is internationally known in the field of public finance and fiscal policy and has served widely as a consultant to developing and transitioning economy countries for the International Monetary Fund (IMF), The World Bank, the Asian Development Bank, and various other organizations and governments. In addition to serving several years as a senior staff economist for the IMF and The World Bank, he directed the USAID-funded Jamaican and Guatemalan Tax Reforms and has held numerous positions as chief of party for development projects in several regions of the world. He has published numerous books, including *Urban Public Finance in Developing Countries* (co-authored with J. Linn in 1992 and published by Oxford University Press). In 1991, he was invited to be a special adviser on local government finance issues to the People's Republic of China Finance Ministry, a position that he still holds.

ix

Stephen J. Bailey is a professor of Public Sector Economics at Glasgow Caledonian University. His main research area is public finance and he has published extensively in refereed academic journals. His sole-authored books are *Strategic Public Finance* (2004), *Public Sector Economics: Theory, Policy and Practice* (2nd ed., 2002), and *Local Government Economics: Principles and Practice* (1999), all published by Palgrave Macmillan. He maintains the Local Government Charges section of the Chartered Institute of Public Finance and Accountancy's online Technical Information Service (TISonline).

Cal Clark is the MPA director and a professor of Political Science at Auburn University. He previously taught at the University of Wyoming and New Mexico State University and has been a visiting professor at Chung Yuan Christian University and Tunghai University in Taiwan. His primary research interests concern comparative public policy, economic and political development, and democratization in East Asia. He currently serves on the editorial board of *Journal of Public Affairs Education*. He is the author or editor of 15 books.

Musharraf R. Cyan has worked in government and with international development agencies in the areas of fiscal decentralization and public sector expenditure management and development policy for 15 years. Currently he is a research associate and PhD candidate in Economics at Andrew Young School of Policy Studies, Georgia State University. In addition to his work on intergovernmental sharing of natural resource revenues, he takes part in the ongoing research at the school on tax systems, intergovernmental transfers, and fiscal reform in developing and transition countries. He has authored a number of reports and papers on intergovernmental transfers, development policy, and taxation. He has designed, managed, and implemented training programs for senior and middle level public sector officials. Working for Asian Development Bank (2002–2005), his brief included carrying out a policy dialogue with senior government policy makers in support of fiscal decentralization, design of decentralization instruments for budgeting and public resource management, development of transparent data systems, and capacity building for intergovernmental transfers and local taxation. His work includes studies on subnational taxation in Pakistan (with The World Bank), program evaluation in social sectors, law and justice, fiscal decentralization and structural adjustment (with the Asian Development Bank), and creation of new approaches for public sector training programs for implementation of fiscal decentralization.

Salvador Espinosa P. is an assistant professor at the School of Public Affairs at San Diego State University. He holds a BA in Economics from Universidad Panamericana (Mexico), and an MPA and a PhD in Public Affairs from Indiana University. He specializes in fiscal decentralization, public financial administration, and intergovernmental relations. His current research focuses on the budgetary impact of federal transfers in Mexico. Before starting his doctoral degree, Salvador worked as budget analyst for the City of Bloomington, Indiana; a research associate for the Indiana Fiscal Policy Institute (Indianapolis, IN); and Coordinator of Information and Economic Development for the government of the state of Guanajuato (Mexico). In addition to his scholarly activities, Salvador works as a public finance consultant for state and local governments.

Ronald W. Johnson is senior policy advisor in International Development at RTI International. Previously the executive vice president of the International Development group at RTI, Dr. Johnson specializes in public budgeting and finance and governance reforms in developing countries. In his career at RTI, he has led projects in decentralization strategies, local governance reform, and public sector capital finance in developing countries in all regions of the world. As executive vice

president, he was the corporate officer in charge of RTI International Local Governance Program (funded under contract with USAID) in Iraq from the start in 2003 until December 2007, and continues to participate as a governance expert in the program.

Mike Joyce is an adjunct professor at Queen's University's School of Policy Studies in Canada. At Queen's he teaches courses related to government expenditure management and budgeting as well as the program's core public sector management course. His research interests include the impact of recent changes to the federal budgeting process in Canada, government accountability for its overall management of expenditures and the related role of the Canadian Parliament, and the effectiveness of the Treasury Board Secretariat in its expenditure management role. He is a member of the Board of Advisers for the *OECD Journal on Budgeting*. Previously, Mike was senior assistant secretary responsible for the Canadian Treasury Board Secretariat's Expenditure Management Sector where he was directly responsible for the expenditure management role played by the Treasury Board. He played a lead role in developing and implementing a number of the Secretariat's expenditure management initiatives and served as the Secretariat's representative on the OECD's Senior Budget Officers Working Group. From 1991 to 1993, Mike worked as an assistant secretary in the Australian government's Department of Finance as part of an exchange program with the Treasury Board. During that time, he played a lead role in the Australian government's initiative to commercialize administrative services and to introduce optionality for departments in their real property needs.

Jamil E. Jreisat is professor of public administration and political science in the Department of Government and International Affairs at the University of South Florida. Dr. Jreisat is the author of numerous books and articles on issues in public administration, comparative government, and administrative reform in the Arab world, including *Politics without Process: Administering Development in the Arab World* (Reinner, 1997) and *Comparative Public Administration and Policy* (Westview, 2002). He teaches public budgeting and has chaired an international team to develop performance budgeting for Jordan. Dr. Jreisat serves on the editorial boards of several professional publications, is the associate editor of the *Journal of Asian and African Studies*, and is the recipient of many awards including the University of South Florida's President's Award for Professional Excellence.

Changhoon Jung is an associate professor in the Department of Political Science at Auburn University. He teaches public budgeting and finance, and public financial management. His research interests include public budgeting and finance, public financial management, state and local service delivery, and state and local economic development policy. He currently serves on the editorial board of *International Review of Public Administration* and has published more than 15 journal articles.

Charlotte Kirschner is a PhD candidate at the Trachtenberg School of Public Policy and Public Administration at The George Washington University. Her research focuses on the state and local government financing of homeland security policies and international budgeting practices for disasters in the United States.

Tsuey-ping Lee is an associate professor in the Department of Political Science at National Chung-Cheng University in Taiwan. She received her PhD from SUNY, Albany. Her major areas of research include public finance, public policy with an emphasis on welfare and environmental policy, and system dynamics. She is an author of one book and seven articles in the field of public management.

Deniz Zeynep Leuenberger is an assistant professor of political science/public administration and the Faculty Director of the Institute for Regional Development at Bridgewater State College, Massachusetts. She specializes in public finance and budgeting, sustainable development, and non-governmental organization management. She also teaches courses in the areas of research methods, urban community/economic development, and Middle Eastern government. Dr. Leuenberger has been actively pursuing research and student programming in the United Arab Emirates, focusing on the areas of budgeting reform, nongovernmental organization management, and sustainable development. She is also an active member of ASPA, is the chair of the STPA Executive Committee, and is a member of the ABFM Executive Committee.

Craig S. Maher teaches graduate-level courses in public budgeting and finance, municipal management, research methods, performance management, and policy analysis in the University of Wisconsin–Oshkosh’s Masters of Public Administration Program. His primary research interests include public finance with emphases in fiscal federalism, fiscal health, revenue forecasting, and K–12 finance. Professor Maher’s work has recently been published in the following journals: *Public Finance Review*, *Public Budgeting and Finance*, *Public Budgeting, Accounting and Financial Management*, *Publius*, *International Journal of Public Administration*, *Marquette Law Review*, and the *Korean Journal of Public Policy*.

Christine R. Martell is an associate professor at the University of Colorado Denver’s School of Public Affairs. Her fields of interest include public finance and public policy. In particular, her research pertains to the development of credit markets for developing countries, fiscal federalism, budgeting, and debt management. Dr. Martell has a passion for international development issues and has conducted research in countries such as Brazil.

William McCabe is a lecturer of public sector accounting, budgeting, and auditing at Manchester Metropolitan University. He specializes in public sector accounting, budgeting, and auditing. He also conducts consultancy work in developing countries and has worked on a number of projects financed by the European Union, The World Bank, and Department for International Development (DFID) (UK government). The projects have covered public financial management, accruals accounting, and external and internal audit reform. His main research areas are public-private partnerships and best value in local government.

Patrizio Monfardini is research assistant in business administration at University of Siena, Italy. He received a PhD in public sector accounting and management in 2006 at University of Siena. He teaches public sector accounting and management control for public sector at the undergraduate, postgraduate, and master level. His research interests are focused on public sector ethics, sustainable development, and corporate social responsibility.

Riccardo Mussari took up his professorship at the University of Siena, Italy in 1999. He has been a visiting scholar at several US, Australian, and Japanese universities. His doctorate thesis (published in 1990) focused on public management theory. He has published on public sector accounting and management issues, with refereed articles in public administration, public management, and accounting journals. He has been part of major national and international research projects comparing public sector reforms in Italy with various other countries. He is a member of the scientific and editorial boards of several Italian and international scientific journals. His research and teaching interests include public sector management and accounting, knowledge management, program

evaluation, and management control in public sector organizations. He also consults, nationally and internationally, on public sector management, management control, performance measurement, and program evaluation. At present, he serves as head of the Department of Business and Social Studies, University of Siena, is a member of the Board of the Italian Academy of Business Administration and Management, is one of the vice presidents of the International Public Management Network, is Chair of EGPA (European Group of Public Administration) Public Financial Management Study Group, and is one of the Italian representatives in the IFSAM (International Federation of Scholarly Association of Management) Council. He is also member of the SICA Committee.

Meili Niu graduated from the School of public administration at the University of Nebraska and is currently an associate professor in the School of Government and a research fellow of the Center for Public Administration Research at Sun Yat-Sen University, China. Dr. Niu does research on public budgeting and financial management and has published in various American and Chinese professional journals. She has done numerous consulting projects for central, provincial, and local Chinese governments and has assisted a number of Chinese local governments in implementing budgetary and legislative reforms. Dr. Niu also serves on the editorial board of *Journal for Public Administration*.

Phuong Nguyen-Hoang is a PhD candidate in public administration at the Maxwell School, Syracuse University. His research interests center on local government finance, particularly education finance in the United States and on public policy issues in developing countries.

Marvin Phaup is a research scholar and professorial lecturer at the Trachtenberg School of Public Policy and Public Administration, the George Washington University, and director of the Federal Budget Reform Initiative for Pew Charitable Trusts. He formerly headed the Financial Studies/Budget Process group at the Congressional Budget Office (CBO), where his work focused on analyses of federal financial policies and institutions, and implications for their budgetary treatment. He also supported the CBO member of the Federal Accounting Standards Advisory Board. He holds a PhD in economics from the University of Virginia and a BA from Roanoke College.

Pasquale Ruggiero is assistant professor in business administration at University of Siena, Italy. He obtained a PhD in public sector accounting and management in 2005 at the University of Siena. He teaches public sector accounting and management control for public sector at the undergraduate, postgraduate, and master level. His research interests are focused on public manager capacities and intellectual capital in public sector organizations.

Hazel Marie A. Sarmiento is a doctoral student at the Public Policy Program at the University of North Carolina at Charlotte. Prior to her doctoral studies, Ms. Sarmiento was a budget and management specialist at the Fiscal Planning Bureau of the Department of Budget and Management (DBM), which is an oversight agency in the government of the Philippines that is in charge of the formulation, implementation, and analysis of the national budget. She has 10 years of experience working with the Philippine government on macroeconomics, fiscal policy, and other public finance issues. She also has extensive academic training on Philippine public policy as well as Asian public policy through the University of the Philippines and the Hitotsubashi University in Tokyo, Japan. Her research interests include budget reforms and measuring efficiency in government spending. She expects to complete her doctoral studies in 2012.

Larry Schroeder is a professor of public administration at the Maxwell School, Syracuse University. His research interests center on local government finance, financial management, and intergovernmental fiscal relations, particularly in developing countries.

Ricardo Silva-Morales has been a Senior Fiscal Policy Advisor onsite in Baghdad, Iraq within the RTI Local Governance Program since 2005. In that capacity, he participates in the US Embassy Budget Reform and Budget Execution advisory team, works closely with Ministry of Finance officials on intergovernmental fiscal relations, and with provincial governors and council members on capital investment budgeting. Prior to his work in Iraq, he worked as an intergovernmental fiscal policy specialist and decentralization advisor in a number of Latin American, Eastern European, and Central Asian countries.

Arwiphawee Srithongrung, assistant professor (DPA, University of Illinois at Springfield), teaches public budgeting, quantitative methods in public administration, the public economy, and introduction to public administration. Her research interests include comparative study in public budgeting, infrastructure management, budgetary institutions, and economic growth. She presented papers at the International Atlantic Economic Society, Asia-Pacific Governance Institute and International Public Management Network, and the Association for Budgeting and Financial Management conferences. Her recent study, which examines impacts of systematic capital management programs on the American state economic growth, appears in *Public Budgeting and Finance*.

LaShonda M. Stewart received her PhD from Mississippi State University in May 2008. Her current research focuses on local governments' unreserved fund balances and those factors that influence the level of savings maintained. She also contributed (with Doug Goodman) a chapter to *The Judicial Branch of State Government: People, Process, and Politics* (2006). She teaches courses in public administration at Southern Illinois University.

Sally Wallace is a professor of Economics at the Andrew Young School. Dr. Wallace is a former senior economist for the United States Department of Treasury, where she was responsible for forecasting the income tax receipts for the administration, and provided policy advice to the executive branch on the tax implications of corporate and individual investment plans, such as the individual retirement account. She is an expert on revenue forecasting and modeling; federal, state, and local income taxes; and intergovernmental fiscal policy. She has consulted widely on fiscal reform and fiscal decentralization issues for The World Bank, USAID, Asian Development Bank, and foreign government ministries in China, the Philippines, Russia, Kazakhstan, Mongolia, Jamaica, Guatemala, Ukraine, the Dominican Republic, and Uzbekistan.



Reviewers

Philip G. Joyce, PhD

Professor, The Trachtenberg School of Public Policy and Public Administration
The George Washington University
Washington, DC

Robert S. Kravchuk, MPA, MBA, PhD

Professor & Chair, Department of Political Science
University of North Carolina–Charlotte
Charlotte, NC

Joseph Wert, PhD

Associate Professor, Department of Political Science
Indiana University, Southeast
New Albany, IN

