

Literate Thought

Understanding Comprehension and Literacy

Peter V. Paul, PhD

Professor

School of Teaching and Learning

The Ohio State University

Columbus, Ohio

Ye Wang, PhD

Assistant Professor

Department of Communication Sciences and Disorders

Missouri State University

Springfield, Missouri



JONES & BARTLETT
LEARNING

World Headquarters

Jones & Bartlett Learning
40 Tall Pine Drive
Sudbury, MA 01776
978-443-5000
info@jblearning.com
www.jblearning.com

Jones & Bartlett Learning
Canada
6339 Ormindale Way
Mississauga, Ontario L5V 1J2
Canada

Jones & Bartlett Learning
International
Barb House, Barb Mews
London W6 7PA
United Kingdom

Jones & Bartlett Learning books and products are available through most bookstores and online booksellers. To contact Jones & Bartlett Learning directly, call 800-832-0034, fax 978-443-8000, or visit our website, www.jblearning.com.

Substantial discounts on bulk quantities of Jones & Bartlett Learning publications are available to corporations, professional associations, and other qualified organizations. For details and specific discount information, contact the special sales department at Jones & Bartlett Learning via the above contact information or send an email to specialsales@jblearning.com.

Copyright © 2012 by Jones & Bartlett Learning, LLC

All rights reserved. No part of the material protected by this copyright may be reproduced or utilized in any form, electronic or mechanical, including photocopying, recording, or by any information storage and retrieval system, without written permission from the copyright owner.

Production Credits

Publisher: David D. Cella
Associate Editor: Maro Gartside
Editorial Assistant: Teresa Reilly
Senior Production Editor: Renée Sekerak
Production Assistant: Sean Coombs
Marketing Manager: Grace Richards
Manufacturing and Inventory Control Supervisor: Amy Bacus
Cover Design: Kristin E. Parker
Cover Image: Book © Arossoft/Dreamstime.com; Brain © Linda Bucklin/Dreamstime.com;
Keyboard © Janaka Dharmasena/Dreamstime.com; Screen © Seesea/Dreamstime.com;
Sound © Vladimirdreams/Dreamstime.com
Composition: DataStream Content Solutions, LLC
Printing and Binding: Malloy, Inc.
Cover Printing: Malloy, Inc.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Paul, Peter V.

Literate thought : understanding comprehension and literacy / Peter V. Paul, Ye Wang.

p. ; cm.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN-13: 978-0-7637-7852-1 (casebound)

ISBN-10: 0-7637-7852-4 (casebound)

1. Comprehension 2. Developmentally disabled children. 3. Special education. I. Wang, Ye, 1977- II. Title.

[DNLM: 1. Comprehension. 2. Child. 3. Developmental Disabilities. 4. Education, Special.

5. Language Disorders. 6. Learning Disorders. 7. Reading. BF 325]

BF325.P38 2012

153.4—dc22

2010053635

6048

Printed in the United States of America

15 14 13 12 11 10 9 8 7 6 5 4 3 2 1

Contents

	Prefacexi
	Acknowledgmentsxv
	About the Authorsxvii
	Reviewersxix
Chapter 1	Introduction to Literate Thought	1
	Perspectives on Writing	3
	<i>Rubin (1995)</i>	3
	<i>Paul and Wang (2006a)</i>	4
	<i>Writing and External Representation</i>	6
	Orality and Internal Representation	7
	Literate Mind	11
	Literate Thought	13
	<i>Requisites of Literate Thought</i>	14
	Literate Thought and Other Domains	20
	<i>New and Multiple Literacies</i>	20
	<i>Cognitive and Disciplinary Structures</i>	21
	<i>Critico-Creative Thinking</i>	23
	Education for Thinking and the Future	24
	Summary	25
	Questions for Reflection and Discussion	27
	References	27
	Further Reading	31
Chapter 2	Comprehension and Literate Thought	33
	Comprehension	36
	<i>Intratextual and Intertextual Comprehension</i>	37

<i>Listening and Reading Comprehension</i>	40
<i>Comprehension and Literate Thought</i>	44
Access/Interpretation	46
Forms of Captured Verbal Information	50
<i>Script (Print) Literacy</i>	51
<i>Merits of Print Literacy</i>	54
<i>Performance Literacy</i>	55
<i>Comparison of Script and Performance Literacy</i>	57
Implications for Research	58
Summary	61
Questions for Reflection and Discussion	63
References	63
Further Reading	67

Chapter 3	New and Multiple Literacies	69
	Definition of Literacy	70
	<i>Traditional Literacy</i>	70
	<i>New and Multiple Literacies</i>	72
	Paradigms of the New and Multiple Literacies	74
	<i>Learning Paradigm</i>	75
	<i>Change Paradigm</i>	76
	<i>Power Paradigm</i>	76
	Media of the New and Multiple Literacies	76
	<i>Internet</i>	77
	<i>Video Gaming</i>	81
	Impact of the New and Multiple Literacies on	
	Literate Thought and Assumptions about	
	Knowledge	83
	<i>Modes of Literacy and Accessing Information</i>	84
	<i>Modes of Literacy and Interpreting/Utilizing</i>	
	<i>Information</i>	86
	<i>Conclusion</i>	88
	Children with Disabilities and ELLs	89
	<i>New and Multiple Literacies in Science</i>	
	<i>Education</i>	90
	<i>Universal Design</i>	91
	<i>Conclusion</i>	92

	Summary	93
	Questions for Reflection and Discussion	95
	References	96
	Further Reading	99
Chapter 4	Cognition and Discipline Structures	101
	Nature and Relevance of Cognitive Psychology . . .	103
	Cognitive Models	107
	<i>Structures, Processes, and Products</i>	107
	<i>A Brief History of the Development of</i>	
	<i>Cognitive Models</i>	109
	<i>Prelude to Cognition and Knowledge Structures</i> . .	110
	Cognition and Knowledge Structures	113
	<i>Cognition and Literacy</i>	115
	<i>Cognition and Mathematics</i>	122
	<i>Cognition and Science</i>	127
	<i>Summary</i>	132
	Qualitative-Similarity Hypothesis	133
	<i>Matthew Effects and the Developmental</i>	
	<i>Lag Hypothesis</i>	135
	<i>Application to Children with Disabilities</i>	136
	Summary	138
	Questions for Reflection and Discussion	139
	References	140
	Further Reading	146
Chapter 5	Critico-Creative Thinking	147
	Nature, Characteristics, and Forms	149
	<i>Weak and Strong Forms</i>	151
	<i>A Brief Summary</i>	152
	General or Domain-Specific	155
	<i>The Generalizability Problem</i>	155
	<i>Summary</i>	160
	Evaluation Issues	162
	<i>Role of Epistemology</i>	163
	<i>Evaluation of the General View</i>	165
	<i>Evaluation of the Domain-Specific View</i>	166

Instructional Issues	167
<i>Simple Instructional Activities</i>	168
<i>Complex Instructional Activities</i>	170
Summary	174
Questions for Reflection and Discussion	176
References	176
Further Reading	178

Chapter 6 Children with Language/Learning Disabilities . . .179

Terms Associated with Language/Learning	
Disabilities	181
Children with Deficits in Word Recognition	183
<i>Significance of Word Recognition Fluency</i>	184
<i>Strategies in Word Recognition</i>	184
<i>Summary of Research</i>	186
Children with Deficits in Written Language	
Comprehension	188
Vocabulary	188
Metalinguistic Awareness	189
Prior Knowledge	190
Cognitive and Metacognitive Strategies	191
Summary of Research	194
Children Who Are Less Engaged and Less	
Intrinsically Motivated in Reading	194
Children with Deficits in Speech	195
Literate Thought and Language/Learning	
Disabilities	197
<i>Can Children with Language/Learning Disabilities</i>	
<i>Obtain and Utilize Information in Modalities</i>	
<i>Other Than Print?</i>	198
<i>Can Skills Acquired in Other Modalities of</i>	
<i>Literacy Be Used to Improve Print</i>	
<i>Literacy Skills?</i>	200
<i>What Are the Instructional Applications of</i>	
<i>the New and Multiple Literacies?</i>	202
Summary	204
Questions for Reflection and Discussion	206
References	206
Further Reading	211

Chapter 7	Children with Sensory Disabilities	213
	Reading Achievement of Children with Visual Impairment	216
	Reading Development of Children with Visual Impairment	218
	<i>Braille Literacy</i>	219
	<i>Braille and Print Literacy</i>	222
	Conclusion: Reading and Children with Visual Impairment	223
	Reading Achievement of Children Who Are Deaf or Hard of Hearing	224
	Reading Development and Children Who Are Deaf or Hard of Hearing	228
	<i>Access to Phonology of English</i>	229
	<i>Access to Morphology</i>	234
	<i>Access to Syntax</i>	236
	Conclusion: Reading and Deafness	237
	Literate Thought and Children with Sensory Disabilities	238
	<i>Use of Technology</i>	239
	<i>Caption Literacy</i>	242
	<i>Role of Language</i>	243
	<i>Instructional Applications of the New and Multiple Literacies</i>	244
	Summary	246
	Questions for Reflection and Discussion	247
	References	247
	Further Reading	254
Chapter 8	Children with Developmental Disabilities	255
	General Reading Skills of Children with Developmental Disabilities	257
	<i>Reading Instruction: Sight Word Versus Phonics</i>	258
	<i>Role of Phonological-Related Skills in Decoding</i>	260
	<i>Reading Interventions on Word Recognition and Language Comprehension</i>	263
	<i>Reading Interventions on Self-Confidence and Motivation</i>	264
	<i>Conclusion</i>	265

Reading and Children with Down Syndrome	266
Reading and Children with Williams Syndrome . . .	268
Reading and Children with Autism Spectrum Disorders	269
<i>Reading and Children with Asperger Syndrome</i> . . .	271
Literate Thought and Children with Developmental Disabilities	275
<i>Technology in the New and Multiple Literacies</i> . . .	278
Summary	279
Questions for Reflection and Discussion	281
References	281
Further Reading	285
 Chapter 9 English Language Learners	287
Different Terms Associated with English Language Learners	288
Literacy Development of English Language Learners	291
<i>Word Recognition Skills</i>	291
<i>Written Language Comprehension Skills</i>	295
<i>Motivational Factors</i>	299
<i>Conclusion</i>	299
Literacy Instruction, Programs, and Assessment . . .	300
<i>Literacy Instructional Strategies</i>	300
<i>Literacy Programs</i>	302
<i>Literacy Assessment</i>	305
<i>Conclusion</i>	307
Sociocultural Contexts and Literacy Achievement	307
<i>Influence of Home Environment or Culture</i>	307
<i>Influence of the Community</i>	308
<i>Conclusion</i>	310
Literate Thought and English Language Learners . .	311
<i>Technology and the New and Multiple Literacies</i> . .	311
Summary	313
Questions for Reflection and Discussion	314
References	315
Further Reading	319

Chapter 10	Literate Thought in a Brave New World	321
	Major Tenets of Literate Thought: Redux	322
	<i>Relationship Between Orality and Literacy</i>	323
	<i>Complexity of Orality Versus Print Literacy</i>	324
	<i>Reconceptualization of Literacy</i>	325
	Functional Literacy: An Ambiguity	327
	Educational Literacy	329
	Future Research on Literate Thought	330
	Final Remarks	331
	Summary	332
	Questions for Reflection and Discussion	333
	References	333
	Further Reading	335
	Index	337

Preface

But any true understanding of Einstein's imagination and intuition will not come from poking around at his patterns of glia and grooves. The relevant question was how his mind worked, not his brain.

The explanation that Einstein himself most often gave for his mental accomplishments was his curiosity. As he put it near the end of his life, "I have no special talents, I am only passionately curious."

Isaacson, 2007, p. 548

Thus far, understanding how the *mind* works has eluded scholars and philosophers, despite their passionate endeavors and rigorous methods. Part of the difficulty is that we cannot actually observe the workings of the mind. We cannot see the *imagination*, *intuition*, or *curiosity* of the individual. As implied by the above passage, examining the structures and actions of the brain may not reveal much about the intricate processes that take place in the mind.

Social forces—that is, events, structures, and practices that occur *outside-the-head*—certainly contribute to mental development; nevertheless, thinking is a mental activity. Thinking is a process that culminates in products such as thoughts, art, mathematics, and written language. These products do provide some insights into the nature of thinking—but not necessarily the entire picture.

Although adopting a completely *internalist* position is not tenable, our goal is still to describe what is going on *inside-the-head* when individuals engage in science, mathematics, reading, and, in our case, the development of literate thought. As such, literate thought may be a metaphor for cognition; however, we have just begun the journey, especially with this book, of exploring the possible processes and components associated with this metaphor.

The journey begins with an introduction in Chapter 1 of the multifaceted concept of literate thought, defined as the ability to think creatively, logically, rationally, and reflectively. We explore the influence of writing on the use of oral (through-the-air) language and as an external aid in the development of thought. We also attempt to clarify the nature of the demands and constraints associated with the use of orality or the oral tradition for an internal representation of reality. More important, it is suggested that other external forms of captured information might be equivalent to or can provide similar benefits as does writing. In the rest of the chapter, we connect literate thought to other diverse domains such as the New and Multiple Literacies, cognitive or disciplinary models, and critico-creative thinking skills.

Chapter 2 explores the notion of comprehension and relates it to the development of literate thought, particularly with respect to the different types of literacy. We argue that additional research is needed on non-print forms of captured information and the manner in which these forms are affected by skills associated with general listening or language comprehension. A portion of the chapter is devoted to delineating a few major processes and components of literate thought. Although it is admitted that literate thought is not an inside-the-head entity only, we maintain that social practices or environmental enrichment activities will not contribute much to its development (or any other cognitive activity) if individuals do not possess the ability to access and interpret these realms of experiences.

Chapter 3 provides insights into the *brave new world* of the New and Multiple Literacies and the impact on our understanding of literate thought and knowledge. The word *literacy* now means more than the ability to read and write given the multitude of terms that have emerged in recent years. Nevertheless, we emphasize a recurring theme—namely that *literacy* should be defined broadly as a form of captured information. We assert that a few print literacy skills are required in certain New and Multiple Literacies activities whereas other New and Multiple Literacies activities do not involve any basic print literacy skills. The chapter concludes with the effects of the New and Multiple Literacies on children with disabilities and those who have traditional language/literacy problems such as English Language Learners (ELLs).

In Chapters 4 and 5, we complete our discussion of the multifaceted concept of literate thought. The focus of Chapter 4 is on the nature of two broad themes and their interactions: cognitive models and discipline

structures. After providing a brief introduction to models, structures, processes, and products, we discuss the contributions of cognitive psychology to the acquisition of discipline knowledge in three areas: literacy, mathematics, and science. We emphasize what it means to operate like a literacy expert or to think like a mathematician or scientist. In fact, we are convinced of the need for a better understanding of the structures of the disciplines and the capabilities of individuals to acquire and develop their knowledge in a specific discipline.

The murky, but interesting, world of critico-creative thinking is examined in Chapter 5. The term *critico-creative* combines the concepts of critical thinking and that of creative thinking. There should be a few surprises in this chapter when readers grapple with the various problems and challenges associated with generalizability and evaluation. Regardless of whether one believes in general aspects (i.e., generalizations across domains or subjects) or in specific, disciplinary or domain aspects, we maintain that the underlying values and attitudes associated with critico-creative thinking remain constant across content areas or subjects. Finally, the chapter provides a few examples of instructional exercises ranging from simple to complex. These activities can be developed to be used in through-the-air and captured modes.

Chapters 6 to 8 provide highlights on the challenges of developing literate language in various groups of children with disabilities. The types of disabilities we cover include children with language and/or learning disabilities (Chapter 6), children with sensory disabilities such as visual and hearing impairments (Chapter 7), and children with cognitive and developmental disabilities, including mental retardation and autism (Chapter 8). In each chapter, it is important to describe the characteristics of the population, especially those associated with various subgroups.

A considerable portion of each chapter (6 to 8) is devoted to a synthesis of the literature on the development of English language and literacy to illustrate, in part, the range and depth of these difficulties. Much of the attention is devoted to the development of and problems with reading or script literacy skills because reading has received much emphasis in the schools. Finally, we demonstrate the application of the concepts of the New and Multiple Literacies and conclude with specific implications for developing literate thought.

One of the fastest growing groups of children in K to 12th grade settings is that of children who are English Language Learners (ELLs), as discussed in Chapter 9. These children present enormous challenges for teachers and clinicians. After explaining various terms associated with this

population, we synthesize the research on the development and teaching of English focusing on word recognition skills, written language comprehension skills, and motivational factors. We provide highlights on issues such as instruction, programs, and assessment, and we examine the need to consider the effects of sociocultural contexts on literacy achievement. Finally, we conclude with implications for developing literate thought, emphasizing that technology can and should play a major role.

Historically, many educators and scholars have inquired: What is or should be the goal of education? What is or should be the goal of language and literacy programs? Fast forward to the beginning of the twenty-first century. Are we preparing students and others to live in a *brave new world*? It is possible that our students—adolescents and young adults—may turn out to be the *dumbest generation* (Bauerlein, 2008). Even with technological advances and accessibility to information, students expend much of their time and energy on social networking and discovering shortcuts with respect to obtaining and understanding knowledge. In fact, several scholars remarked that most of today's youth (and even a number of adults) exhibit a blatant disregard for deep, serious reading and reflective, rational thinking (Bauerlein; Blackburn, 2005; Specter, 2009).

In our view, the goal of education is to develop literate thought as we remark repeatedly throughout the book and, again, in Chapter 10. We warn about the shortcomings associated with concepts such as functional literacy and the vocationalization of education. With the proliferation of ideas about virtual realities, multiple realities, and possible realities, educators and clinicians need to extend their techniques so that students can handle these different types of realities. This is important for the further development of imagination, intuition, creativity, and, of course, literate thought. In essence, literate thought might be mandatory for survival in a *brave new world*.

REFERENCES

- Bauerlein, M. (2008). *The dumbest generation: How the digital age stupefies young Americans and jeopardizes our future (or, don't trust anyone under 30)*. New York: Penguin.
- Blackburn, S. (2005). *Truth: A guide*. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Isaacson, W. (2007). *Einstein: His life and universe*. New York: Simon & Schuster.
- Specter, M. (2009). *Denialism: How irrational thinking hinders scientific progress, harms the planet, and threatens our lives*. New York: Penguin Press.

Acknowledgments

We are indebted to the researchers who provided the findings on which this book is based. We are grateful to both our reviewers for their valuable comments on earlier drafts and Ms. Sara Hann, a graduate student at Missouri State University, for assisting us with the index and literature search. The contributions of the staff at Jones & Bartlett Learning, especially Sean Coombs, Maro Gartside, and David Cella, are also appreciated. Thanks to our spouses and children, who helped to maintain our sanity. The first author would like to acknowledge (again) the guidance of his mentor (now retired), Dr. Stephen P. Quigley. The contributions of a mentor leave a lasting imprint and become even more prominent in one's subsequent scholarly works.

About the Authors

Peter V. Paul, PhD, is a Professor in the School of Teaching and Learning in the College of Education & Human Ecology at the Ohio State University. One of his major responsibilities is teacher education for individuals interested in the education of d/Deaf or hard of hearing students. Dr. Paul's research interests involve the areas of vocabulary, language, and literacy. He has published extensively on language and literacy development. His scholarly texts include *Education and Deafness* (1990), *Toward a Psychology of Deafness* (1993), *Literacy and Deafness* (1998), *Language and Deafness* (2009, 4th ed.), *Reading and Deafness* (2010; with B. Trezek and Y. Wang), and *Hearing and Deafness* (2011). Dr. Paul has conducted workshops for educators and parents on an international, national, state, and local level on topics in literacy and literate thought. He is the current Editor of the *American Annals of the Deaf* (established in 1847), the oldest professional journal in the field of deafness. Dr. Paul has received the College of Education Senior Research Award (2000) and the Richard and Laura Kretschmer National Leadership Award in Hearing Impairment (2010; Ohio School Speech Pathology Educational Audiology Coalition [OSSPEAC]).

Ye Wang, PhD, is an Assistant Professor and Program Coordinator for Education of the Deaf and Hard of Hearing Program in the Department of Communication Sciences and Disorders, Missouri State University. Dr. Wang is a teacher educator preparing teachers of the d/Deaf and hard of hearing students as well as a researcher. Dr. Wang's primary research interest is the language and literacy development of students who are d/Deaf or hard of hearing. Her other research and scholarly interests include multiple literacies, technology and literacy instruction, inclusive education, research methodology, and early childhood education. She has numerous scholarly publications including books, chapters, and peer-reviewed academic journal articles. Dr. Wang has been active as a guest reviewer for several journals as well as a member of the Editorial Board and a guest editor of a special issue for the *American Annals of the Deaf*.

Reviewers

Martha Dunkelberger, PhD, CCC-SLP
Assistant Clinical Professor
Communication Sciences and Disorders
The University of Houston
Houston, TX

Renee Fabus, PhD, CCC-SLP, TSHH
Assistant Professor
Department of Speech Communication Arts and Sciences
Brooklyn College
Brooklyn, NY

Monica Gordon Pershey, EdD, CCC-SLP
Associate Professor and Program Director
Speech and Hearing Program
Department of Health Sciences
Cleveland State University
Cleveland, OH

Deborah M. Haydon, EdD
Associate Professor
Education of the Deaf and Hard of Hearing Program
Eastern Kentucky University
Richmond, KY

Karole Howland, PhD
Clinical Assistant Professor
Speech, Language, and Hearing Sciences
Boston University
Boston, MA

Thomas L. Layton, PhD
ASHA Fellow
Professor
Department of Communications Disorders
North Carolina Central University
Durham, NC

Colleen McAleer, PhD
Department of Communication Sciences and Disorders
Clarion University
Clarion, PA

Wendy McCarty, EdD
Associate Professor
Department of Education
Illinois College
Jacksonville, IL

Johanna Price, PhD, CCC-SLP
Assistant Professor
Department of Speech-Language Pathology
Mississippi University for Women
Columbus, MS

Susan M. Schultz, EdD
Graduate Program Director
Special Education
St. John Fisher College
Rochester, NY

Mary Shea, PhD
Director of Graduate Literacy Programs
Canisius College
Buffalo, NY